Two Million Years of Art in Human Evolution

AH 224 Paleolithic Art, Spring 2012

James Harrod, Ph.D.
Adjunct Instructor in Art History, Maine College of Art, Portland, Maine
Director, Center for Research on the Origins of Art and Religion
originsnet.org (pleistocenecoalition.com)
**MYTHO-STRATIGRAPHY**

- Mythic III
  - Eurasian
  - ‘shamanic’
- Mythic II
  - ‘Southern Route’
- Mythic I
  - ‘Khoisan’

- Complex Idea Modeling
- Conceptual Symbolic Modeling
A 2011 Hominin Paleogenomics Phylotree

Neanderthal archaeological dispersal range -- 2011
Homo sapiens neanderthalensis

Wells, HG. 1921. The Outline of History: 58. New York: Macmillan; from University of South Florida
Homo sapiens neanderthalensis

Left: Archeology Magazine, Jan-Feb, 1996: 37
Right, La Quina reconstruction; Archaeology Magazine, Nov-Dec, 1997: 72
Updated Homo sapiens neanderthalensis

Lorenzo, R, Discovery Magazine, Feb 23, 2011
on Peresani Fumane Cave feathers 2011; artist reconstruction Mauro Cutrona
Homo sapiens neanderthalensis
Two *Homo sapiens* dispersal routes to SE Asia – 2011 – ? M and N → R

Rasmussen, M., et al. 2011. An Aboriginal Australian Genome Reveals Separate Human Dispersals into Asia. *Science* 334, 6052: 94-98; Fig. 2.
### 3rd Meme of the Evolution of Art, Symbol & Myth

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Era and Techné</th>
<th>3rd Meme: Mythic I &amp; II = archaic Homo sapiens &amp; Homo sapiens sapiens</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Middle Paleolithic / Middle Stone Age</strong></td>
<td>Mythic I: ‘Gaia’ (M. Witzel) = Khoisan mythologies (pre-MP?)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMP ~300 to 40 ka</td>
<td>Mythic II: = ‘Gondwana’ (M. Witzel) = ‘Southern Route’ Africa to SE Asia &amp; Australia = Australian Aboriginal mythologies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MMP ~150 to 60(100) ka</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LMP ~60 to 30/35 ka</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Homo sapiens sapiens Culture by Myth Stage

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Toolkit</th>
<th>Mythology</th>
<th>Art &amp; Religion</th>
<th>Macrolanguage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>East and South Africa</strong></td>
<td>Final Acheulian</td>
<td>Mythic I</td>
<td>Life-Giver vs Death-Wielder</td>
<td>Proto-Sapiens (II Khoisan)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Khoisan) L0; L1; L2-mtDNA</td>
<td>Mode II and/or Early-Middle</td>
<td>‘Pan-Gaea’ (M. Witzel)</td>
<td>Spirits of the Dead return to Life-Giver</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paleolithic / MSA Mode III</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Extraction Healing Dance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>‘Southern Route’</strong></td>
<td>Mid-Middle</td>
<td>Mythic II</td>
<td>Beings of the Dreaming</td>
<td>‘Borean-R’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SW Asia to Sunda-Sahul</td>
<td>Paleolithic / MSA</td>
<td>‘Gondwana’ (M. Witzel)</td>
<td>shape-shifters Creator/Creatrix of lifeforms</td>
<td>(SW Asian Afroasiatic, Pre-Dravidian, Macro-Pama-Nyungan,? Munda, ? Kusunda Isolates; ? Austric; B-Amerind)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L3’MN; ? N-mtDNA → R, U, JT, B, P/O</td>
<td>Mode III</td>
<td>‘Indo-Pacific’ (Y. Berezkin)</td>
<td>mortuary deposition and soul journey</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Eurasia, Americas Africa</strong></td>
<td>Upper Paleolithic / LSA</td>
<td>Mythic III</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ns and S, Y, X, A and M-mtDNA → Ms, D, C and G</td>
<td>Mode IV</td>
<td>‘Laurasian’ (M. Witzel)</td>
<td>3x2=6 Worlds, Journeying Vision Quest</td>
<td>‘Borean-N’ = Burushaski-Caucasic-Déné, Sino-Tibetan and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>‘Eurasian’ (Y. Berezkin)</td>
<td>Master and Mistress of Animals; psychopomp</td>
<td>Pre-Eurasian (Altaic, I.E., Japonic-Ainu, C and D-Amerind)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>‘Shamanism’</td>
<td>UP(E) arrays of female and male spiritual</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>transformations geometric protolanguage</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Meme #3 Mid-Middle Paleolithic: Mythic II
Predominant symbolic behaviors and derived thematics

- **Use of pigment/ornaments:** red and black ‘conjunction of opposites’; ? body painting, pendant ornaments

- **Stone/Bone/Tool arrangements:** ‘Mandala spaces, 4+ directions, laterality L versus R, color opposites’
  (spheroid piles, El Guettar, red, black, white color, geometrics, point; spheroid pile, Windhoek; Bruniquel cave large oval space, ‘ritual space’)

- **Mortuary practices: defleshing, secondary ‘burial’, deposition of dead in rock shelters and caves:**
  ‘Return-to-home’, ‘womb’, ‘going-to-where-I-will-die,’ ‘negative capability’ (to be in state of waiting, dormancy, hibernation, incubation, pre-emergence, prior to sunrise, before-the-beginning, not-knowing yet healing; flesh, embodiment as negative capability)
  (Regourdou burial with bear bones; European MP ‘bear skull’ depositions, Rece Cave, 4 bear skulls (4 directions?); Cioarei-Borosteni Cave, 2 bear skulls back -to-back E-W, 1 bear skull framed by triad of nucleus, scraper, point; (compare alchemical *cauda pavonis*; Taoist ‘uncarved block’; Nagarjuna: state of the ‘not-born’ and the ‘unceasing’ of time; Bracha Ettinger: the matrixial, co-poiesis as revision of Martin Buber ‘I-Thou’)
  (African MSA ‘hyena’ as crusher and devourer of all bones, being totally consumed into death)

- **Marking traditions:**
  - **Cupules:** ‘gathering-into-being-here’, ‘opacity of suffering’; ‘sound of silence’; ‘contact and be alone with reality of finitude’; powder as ‘residue’ (motif, compare Aboriginal increase ceremony: cupule powder on zoomorphic rock yields increase; motif, compare alchemical *Sal*, rust and salt, the residue, remnant as messianic hope) (La Ferrassie; multiple sites from Africa to India to Australia)
  - **Crisscrossing, grid lattice and digital fluting:** ‘reciprocity, exchange, interconnectedness’, ‘the order of relationships and all life-forms’, ‘the law of prescription/proscription + ‘intergenerational transmission, continuance of life’ (Blombos X’s, crisscross grid; Koonalda, digital fluting and grids; Champlost crisscross; etc.)
  - **Cross:** ‘coincidentia oppositorum’ (Tata, ‘cross’ incised on nummulite circular disk)

- **Image and representation:**
  - **Geometric Figurines**, especially the ‘Triangular Female Creatrix, Birth-Giver’; triangular, pentagon, hexagon-shapes; ‘creator beings, female or male or androgynous, of landscape and all life forms and thus intimate community and communion of all peoples and life forms’ (Quneitra, Tabun B; Mousterian of Acheulian Tradition, Har Karkom; HW Site, Surrey UK, MTA) (*JBH*: three dreams of Har Karkom, biface signifies ‘make peace’)

Note: MP ≠ Shamanic (Laurasian) thematics, such as cave as ‘place (container) of emergence/rebirth of animals’; ‘master/mistress of animals’; ‘bear cult’; ‘vision quest’, but thematics more like ‘purification’ and ‘reduction to bone’ (Eliade)
Middle Paleolithic / Middle Stone Age Palaeoart
Biface, Middle Paleolithic, Netherlands
Twin Rivers Kopje, Zambia, A-block, ~265 ka, MSA Lower Lupemban

A-block (mean ~265 ka) and F-block (140-200 ka): 306 specularite, hematite, limonite, manganese dioxide pieces, some evident striations for powder; brown, red, yellow, pink, purple, blue-black; manganese and huge quantity suggest ritual use (Barham 2002); pestlestone with hematite stain on working surface (Clark 2001)

L: hematite crayon; R: limonite crayon. Images: Chip Clark, Smithsonian Institution
Maastricht-Bélvèdere C, River Maas, Netherlands, MIS7 ~230ka or 9 ~320 ka, Early Mousterian

Site C, 15 small concentrates of red hematite pigment, bright-red, yellow-brown, grayish-olive; drops originally spilled from liquid solution. Top L: flint flake next to hematite concentrate; Bottom L: two largest concentrates; R: drops taken as samples (Roebroeks, Sier et al 2012: Fig. 2, 1 and SI4, respectively)
Becov I, Czech Republic, ~200-220 ka, Early Mousterian

- 4 polished quartzite tablets / anvils, one over 0.5 m, which served as pallets for mixing pigments, along with large quantities of porcellanite in diverse shades (yellow, orange, red), with traces of heat treatment (to soften the stone), replication experiments indicate purposeful grinding for pigments; (Fridrich 1976) (Šajnerová-Dušková, S., Fridrich, J. and Fridrichová-Sýkorová 2008: Fig. 5 and 8)

- Red ochre, use striations (WE1985); striated on 2 faces, marks of abrasion, occupation floor stained with ochre in same area, flat rubbing stone (AM1981)

- Polished, round sandstone object (6.85x5.56x4.5cm), interpreted as human head with neck parts of shoulders
Skhul B, Israel, MIS5e(c-e) ~100-137 ka, Tabun C Middle Paleolithic

4 fragments and small pieces of red and orange pigment, heated to at least 300°C, changing yellow goethite to orange and red hematite

Fig. 1 Pieces of pigment, with locations of analyzed samples (d'Errico, Salomon, Vignaud & Stringer 2010: Fig. 1)
Black Colorants, Le Moustier, Dordogne, France, Level G and H ~45-50 ka

L top: W 24.5 cm, calcite plaquette, level G (excavation D. Peyrony), edge retouch, central depression natural, deposit black or locally grey; bottom: LMP1-4, samples taken for analysis of colorant; black manganese dioxide (M. Lorblanchet). R: top and bottom: nodules of black colorant, LMH1-2 top, LMH3 bottom; bear artificial striations, polish, incisions and natural striations (M. Lorblanchet)

Collection: Musée National de Préhistoire des Eyzies

Neanderthal pigment stained shells and perforated shells, Spain, ~50 ka

Top: perforated pigment stained marine shells, yellow geothite and red hematite
Cueva Aviones, SE Spain, ~45-48 cal ka, Mousterian, Neanderthal

Bottom: perforated Pecten shell painted on external white side with orange pigment mix of yellow geothite and red hematite, Cueva Antón, SE Spain, 43.5 cal ka; Zilhao et al 2010.
Neanderthal eagle talons, Typical Mousterian, L 52, Combe-Grenal, France ~90 ka and Les Fieux, France ~40-60 ka

A: example of fully fleshed golden eagle digit; B-E: cutmarked terminal phalanges; B-C: Combe-Grenal, L 52, golden eagle; D-E: Le Fieux, L Jbase, white tailed eagle

Morin E, Laroulandie V. 2012. Presumed Symbolic Use of Diurnal Raptors by Neanderthals. PLoS ONE 7,3: e1-5: Fig. 2.

Combe-Grenal, Typical Mousterian, L 50, ~62 ka, 1 adult, cranials, 1 child, mandible, cutmarks = defleshing, deposition (Le Mort F. 1989)
Neanderthal ‘Ritual Space’, Bruniquel, France >47.6 ka
Oval 5x8m, multiple hearths; 1 burnt bear humerus inside; no tools or habitation, 250m inside cave
L: Rouzaud 1997: photo 1; Balter 1996. R: Fig. Rouzaud, Soulier, and Lignereux, in J. Clottes nd, ‘symbolic or ritual space’
Neanderthal ‘Bear Cult’, Cioarei-Borosteni Cave, Carpathians, Romania

R: top-cut stalagmite receptacles with ochre stains, Level E, 52 ka but biostratigraphy OIS5a >80 ka
   (Carciumaru, Nitu & Tutuiianu-Carciumaru 2010: fig. 5)

L: two crania Ursus spelaeus discovered situated back-to-back, almost touching, and oriented on an East-West axis,
   LG (>) 49.5 ka (Carciumaru, Nitu & Tutuiianu-Carciumaru 2010: fig. 10)
Neanderthal ‘Bear Cult’, Rece Cave, Carpathians, Romania, 75-95 ka U/Th calcite cover (14C ~40 Ka)

Four crania *Ursus spelaeus* with 'an extremely curious disposition' (Carciumaru, Nitu & Tutuianu-Carciumaru 2010: fig. 11)
Photo: James Harrod, 2001
Regourdou, Dordogne, France
Photo: James Harrod, 2001
Regourdou, Dordogne, France – View East from Regourdou Site

Photo: James Harrod, 2001
Neanderthal ‘Bear Cult’, R1 Burial IVa, Regourdou, Dordogne, France, 75-135 ka

Quina and Ferrassie Mousterian tools. Adult male, burial, left side, highly flexed, under ‘paving layer’ and cairn of boulders; with possible grave goods: 2 brown bear tibia; capped by layer of burnt sand and ashes, flint tools (nucleus, scraper, flakes) and additional bear bones and bear teeth and deer bone (Jaubert, Maureille & Turq 2010); (or) evidence body lay on bear hides; deer antler on top of burial mound, covered with another layer of stones and capped by remains of a small fire; next to IVC, incorporating brown bear bones and large stone cap; and IVB 2x2m limestone slab over near-complete young brown bear skeleton; deposited before and after the burial; and a rectangular stone lined pit with 20 bear skulls and red ochre, covered with stone slab (Bonifay & Vandermeersch 1962; Bonifay 1965; Pettitt 2011: Fig 5.9)
Neanderthal ‘Bear Cult’, R1 Burial IVa, Regourdou, Dordogne, France, 75-135 ka
Quina and Ferrassie Mousterian tools. Adult male, burial, left side, highly flexed, under ‘paving layer’ and cairn of boulders; with possible grave goods: 2 brown bear tibia; capped by layer of burnt sand and ashes, flint tools (nucleus, scraper, flakes) and additional bear bones and bear teeth and deer bone (Jaubert, Maureille & Turq 2010); (or) evidence body lay on bear hides; deer antler on top of burial mound, covered with another layer of stones and capped by remains of a small fire (Bonifay & Vandermeersch 1962; Bonifay 1965) Photo: James Harrod, 2001
‘Ritual stone’, Neanderthal ‘Bear Cult’, R1 Burial IVa, Regourdou, Dordogne, France, 75-135 ka
Quina and Ferrassie Mousterian tools. Adult male, burial, left side, highly flexed, under ‘paving layer’ and cairn of boulders; with possible grave goods: 2 brown bear tibia; capped by layer of burnt sand and ashes, flint tools (nucleus, scraper, flakes) and additional bear bones and deer bone (Jaubert, Maureille & Turq 2010); (or) evidence body lay on bear hides; deer antler on top of burial mound, covered with another layer of stones and capped by remains of a small fire (Bonifay & Vandermeersch 1962; Bonifay 1965) Photos: James Harrod, 2001
‘Ritual stone’, Neanderthal ‘Bear Cult’, R1 Burial IVa, Regourdou, Dordogne, France, 75-135 ka

Quina and Ferrassie Mousterian tools. Adult male, burial, left side, highly flexed, under ‘paving layer’ and cairn of boulders; with possible grave goods: 2 brown bear tibia; capped by layer of burnt sand and ashes, flint tools (nucleus, scraper, flakes) and additional bear bones and deer bone (Jaubert, Maureille & Turq 2010); (or) evidence body lay on bear hides; deer antler on top of burial mound, covered with another layer of stones and capped by remains of a small fire (Bonifay & Vandermeersch 1962; Bonifay 1965) Photos: James Harrod, 2001
‘Triangular Incised Stone’, Layer XVII, Qafzeh, Israel, MP Tabun C industry, 85-102 kya

1/3rd meter from Q8 burial; 18 MNI Homo sapiens sapiens (Hovers, Vandermeersch & Bar-Yosef 1997) ochre pieces in all levels, some worked, specific hues selected and manuported 40km (Hovers et al 2003); perforated marine shells from 40km, traces of being strung and a few had red, yellow ochre or black manganese stains (Mayer, Vandermeersch & Bar-Yosef 2009)
‘Incised Stone: 4 Nested Semi-Circles, Overarching Straight Lines’
7.2 cm wide, Quneitra, Golan, Israel, ESR 53,900±5,900 - Tabun B industry

‘Incised Stone: 4 Nested Semi-Circles, Overarching Straight Lines’
7.2 cm wide, Quneitra, Golan, Israel, ESR 53,900±5,900 - Tabun B industry

‘Incised Stone: 4 Nested Semi-Circles, Overarching Straight Lines’
7.2 cm wide, Quneitra, Golan, Israel, ESR 53,900±5,900 - Tabun B industry

El Guettar, Gafsa, Tunisia. Aterian Middle Paleolithic, ~100,000 BP
La Ferrassie, Dordogne, France, ~55-60 kya, Ferrassie and Quina Mousterian
18 cupules (apparently paired) on underside of triangular slab over Neanderthal child (age 3-5) burial
L: museum photo; R: cupules identified, Robert Bednarik
‘Human Face or Animal Mask’, La Roche-Cotard, France, ~35 kya

Layer 7c, Mousterian of Acheulian Tradition, ~33,000 BCE. Flint block.
Found 2002 in entrance La Roche-Cotard on banks of the Loire River, Langeais (Indre-et-Loire)
Photo © BBC News, Tuesday, 2 December, 2003; http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/science/nature/3256228.stm
Fontmaure, France, >40 kya, Mousterian of Acheulian Tradition
‘Tetrahedral female figurine, with zoomorph in lower corner’
L: female figurine ; R: side view, compared to tetrahedron from Pampau, Ohle Pit, Germany
Identification: Jan Evert Musch; photos: Jan Evert Musch
Fontmaure, France, >40 kya, Mousterian of Acheulian Tradition
‘Zoomorphs, mask face, female, perforated biface geometric’
Photos and collection: Tedde Toet
Middle Paleolithic / Middle Stone Age
Markings (‘Signs’ or ‘Gesture Movement Forms’
‘Stroke marks’, ‘Oldisleben I, Germany, OIS5, ~120 ka, Eastern Micoquian

‘Cross or X-sign’, fossil nummulite disk, Tata, Hungary, 75-110 ka, Quina Mousterian
(Vértes 1964) L: Photo: F. Bordes; R: illustration, Bednarik 1995: fig. 7.
Blombos Cave, South Africa. M1 Stillbay MSA, ~74-78 kya
Photo: BBC News
2 incised ochre pieces, with ‘X’ (crosshatch), ‘chevron’, ‘tri-line’, ‘parallel iterated stroke’ signs
Blombos Cave, South Africa. M1 Stillbay MSA, ~74-78 kya
Photo: Henshilwood et al. 2002: fig 2.
L: photo: Stringer & Gamble 1993: fig. 92; Marshack 1982; Kozlowski et al 1982; Kozlowski 1992)  
R: negative illustration, Wikipedia Commons  
at same site 1 perforated wolf canine and 1 bear incisor (Marshack 1991; Vanhaeren 2005)
Digital Fluting, ‘meander sign’, Koonalda Cave, Australia, 16-27 kya
Photo: R. Edwards in Flood, J. 1997: 37
Engraved Ochre, Blombos Cave, South Africa. M1 Stillbay MSA, ~74-78 kya


Ju/'hoan myth Branding of the Animals, wildebeest: “They marked him and marked him and put a little beard on him” (Biesele 1993: 119)
Woman with Wildebeest Head

Engraved Ochre, Blombos Cave, South Africa. M1 Stillbay MSA, ~74-78 kya
Atypical notched backed blades, Klasies River Mouth, South Africa. Howiesons Poort MSA, ~70 kya

Bottom: Interpretation: James Harrod; Top: Singer & Wymer 1982: fig. 6.6: 1. 2: micro-burins; 3 unfinished crescent; 4-17 various notched forms; Wymer 1982: fig.61, calls these "aberrant notched forms of backed blades"
HK190b, MP Mousterian of Acheulian Tradition, ‘Triangular Creatrix’
Har Karkom, Israel

identification, James Harrod; photo James Harrod; Emmanuel Anati Har Karkom Expedition, April 1996
Meme #3 Middle Paleolithic / MSA: Mythic I & II

from Homo erectus/archaic to Homo sapiens sapiens

I ‘Gaia’ = Khoisan & II ‘Southern Route’ or ‘Gondwana’ (M. Witzel)
Middle Paleolithic (MTA), mixed UP, Mesolithic Surface Sites, Warlingham, Surrey, UK
L: Ron Williams  R: Henley Wood (HW) Site, Warlingham, Surrey, UK
Middle Paleolithic (MTA), Upper Paleolithic, Mesolithic

Site discoverer, Ron Williams; Photos: James Harrod, 1989
Ron Williams Sites, Warlingham, Surrey, UK
Acheulian, Middle Paleolithic (MTA), Upper Paleolithic, Mesolithic
Site names, identification, Ron Williams; Map: Jan Evert Musch
‘Horses’, Middle Paleolithic (MTA) mixed Mesolithic
Henley Wood Site, Warlingham, Surrey, UK

identification, Ron Williams; photo Ron Williams; Collection: Ron Williams
‘Female decorated biface + ? ‘egg-cup anvil’, flint, Middle Paleolithic (MTA) mixed Mesolithic, CCC Site, Warlingham, Surrey, UK

identification, Ron Williams; photos Ron Williams; Collection: Ron Williams
‘Female decorated biface’ and ‘Profile head’, Middle Paleolithic (MTA) mixed Mesolithic, OSO Site, Warlingham, Surrey, UK

identification, Ron Williams; photos Ron Williams; Collection: Ron Williams
‘Neanderthal head profile’, Middle Paleolithic (MTA) mixed Mesolithic, Pit Dip Site, Warlingham, Surrey, UK

identification, Ron Williams; photos Ron Williams; Collection: Ron Williams
‘Female decorated biface”, Middle Paleolithic (MTA) mixed Mesolithic, Pit Dip Site, Warlingham, Surrey, UK

identification, Ron Williams; photos Ron Williams; Collection: Ron Williams
'Female decorated biface + skull' figurine, flint, Middle Paleolithic (MTA) mixed Mesolithic Henley Wood (HW) Site, Warlingham, Surrey, UK
identification, Ron Williams; photos Ron Williams; Collection: Ron Williams
‘Birth Giver’ figurines, flint, Middle Paleolithic (MTA) mixed Mesolithic  
Henley Wood (HW) Site, Warlingham, Surrey, UK  
identification, Ron Williams; photo Ron Williams; Collection: Ron Williams
Flint Figurines, Middle Paleolithic (MTA) mixed Mesolithic
Henley Wood (HW) Site, Warlingham, Surrey, UK
identification, Ron Williams; photo James Harrod, 1989; Collection: James Harrod, courtesy Ron Williams
‘Mother and Child’ figurine, flint, Middle Paleolithic (MTA) mixed Mesolithic
Henley Wood (HW) Site, Warlingham, Surrey, UK
identification, Ron Williams; photo James Harrod, 1989; Collection: James Harrod, courtesy Ron Williams
‘Triangular Mother and Child ’ figurines compared to Renaissance Triangular Composition

identification, Ron Williams; photo James Harrod, 1989; Collection: James Harrod, courtesy Ron Williams